

BOOK REVIEWS



Three valuable reference works have come to us recently:

Five volumes in the *Compendium of the Confederate Armies* series, by Stewart Sifakis, **Facts on File, 1995: South Carolina and Georgia (320 Pages, \$29.95); Louisiana (160 Pages, \$24.95); Kentucky, Maryland, Missouri and the Indian Units (216 Pages, \$27.50); Mississippi (160 Pages, \$24.95); and Texas (160 Pages, \$24.95).** These volumes, the first in a projected 11-volume series, will form a comprehensive history of every regiment, battalion, battery, and company that served in the Confederate Army. The series is intended to be the companion set to Frederick H. Dyer's *Compendium of the War of the Rebellion*, a study of all the Union regiments, battalions, batteries, and independent companies. That work, first published as three volumes in 1909, has since been reprinted in two-volume and one-volume editions.

Reference Guide to United States Military History: 1945 to the Present, edited by Charles Reginald Shrader. **Facts on File, 1995. 320 Pages. \$50.00.** This volume is the last of a five-volume series that spans the years since 1607, covering every significant issue, event, battle, innovation, or personality in the history of the armed forces in the United States.

Brassey's Encyclopedia of Military History and Biography. Edited by Franklin D. Margiotta, with Foreword by John Keegan. **Brassey's, 1994. 1,232 Pages. \$44.95.** Specially selected from the six volumes of the widely praised *International Military and Defense Encyclopedia*, this volume is the complete alphabetized guide to the history of warfare and military leaders. Compiled by leading military historians from around the world, it is a handy, readable

reference for anyone interested in military history.

The Poems of General George S. Patton, Jr.: Lines of Fire. Introduced, annotated, and edited by Carmine A. Prioli. **Studies in American Literature, Volume 8. Edwin Mellen Press (Box 450, Lewiston, NY 14092), 1991. 176 Pages. \$59.95.** Reviewed by Colonel Cole C. Kingseed, U.S. Army.

Most Americans are familiar with the military achievements of George S. Patton, Jr., but few realize that he considered himself as much a poet as a soldier. Although several of his poems have appeared in biographies and movies, this is the first time virtually all of his verses have been assembled in a single volume. The result is as entertaining as it is informative.

Patton once remarked to his wife, "I have a hell of a memory for poetry and war." Indeed, he used the medium of poetry to express his knowledge of military history, his conception of manhood, and his personal beliefs in the ennobling aspects of war and its consequences. As editor Prioli states, Patton's poems highlight aspects of his life and personality that are often hidden from public scrutiny and help penetrate the "mask" of command that Patton himself strove to construct.

The Patton who emerges from these pages is a commander who wrote poetry, not for critical acclaim, but for other soldiers. His poems had a purpose—sometimes to spur soldiers on to greater achievement. Often the verses provided an escape from the burdens associated with higher command in war. The collected poems also reveal a more humane Patton than the Patton of the legend, but still a soldier convinced that war is the most magnifi-

cent competition in which a human being can indulge.

Lines of Fire is must reading for all students of one of this country's greatest soldiers. By providing another dimension to the controversial commander, Prioli has made a major contribution to the Patton legend.

Closing With the Enemy: How GIs Fought the War in Europe, 1944-1945. By Michael D. Doubler. **The University Press of Kansas, 1994. 354 Pages. \$29.95.** Reviewed by Lieutenant Colonel Albert N. Garland, United States Army, Retired.

As a former rifle company commander who lived through five months of combat in northwest Europe, Michael Doubler has brought back many memories in this book—good and bad. As a reader can tell by his subtitle, he restricts his comments and discussions to a particular period of time and a particular theater of operations. In actuality, he does not go beyond the Battle of the Bulge and covers only the part of that battle that took place in the Ardennes Forest area.

In general, with two major and several minor exceptions, I felt he had a good grasp of his material—both primary and secondary sources—and used it well to present things as they appeared to the ground combat soldier. I certainly agree with much of what he says: We were not well prepared for the combat we entered into in Europe; and there was much we could, and should, have accomplished before firing our first shots. Our replacement system was bad, and we did not know how to handle large numbers of combat exhaustion cases or the trench-foot problems that plagued us in October and November 1944. But we did learn, and

BOOK REVIEWS

Doubler gives us great credit for doing so.

The major exceptions? He does not mention fighting in mountains, as the Seventh Army had to do in the Sixth Army Group's area and during which many lessons were learned, and he does not mention our airborne operations, either in Normandy or in Holland, both of which offered a significant number of lessons to be pondered.

The minor exceptions? As with most authors writing about the Army's experiences in Europe in 1944-1945, Doubler ignores the Seventh Army's experiences. In addition, infantry regiments, to my knowledge, never possessed "assault guns" (page 14); Doubler does not mention the many lessons learned from the amphibious and airborne operations in North Africa, Sicily, and the early months of the Italian campaign that stood the Army in good stead in preparing for the Normandy crossing; he cites no reference for the statement on page 25 that "senior commanders soon found out that even the best units were capable of only limited, continuous enemy contact and that troops passed their peak efficiency after three days of intensive combat"—these words are not borne out in the later chapters of the book; there were four, not six, U.S. divisions in Normandy in early July 1944 that had previous combat experience—the 2d and 4th Infantry Divisions had no such experience; and, overall, there is too much repetition. In fact, a military instructor could use each chapter separately for discussions on the various operations Doubler talks about: Fighting in restricted terrain (the bocage), city and village fighting (urban terrain), battling strongly fortified positions, conducting opposed river crossings, the horrors of forest fighting, and defensive engagement.

Doubler also uses a separate chapter to discuss the development of air-ground cooperation, another to talk about "the American soldier," and a final one to give his thoughts on "the schoolhouse of war." He includes two useful appendixes, a note on his sources, and an index. His maps are

adequate, and his footnotes appear just before the index.

As an old-line infantryman, I bless Doubler, a serving Army officer, for praising the World War II ground combat soldier. He doesn't excuse any of our weaknesses, and rightly so, but he is willing to say the following:

It is clear that American soldiers were not so numerous or lavishly equipped that they could easily overpower their opponents. . . . It was not overwhelming numbers of American soldiers that defeated the Germans, but the variety of unique, innovative tactics and methods that they employed. . . . (page 108).

Several interesting things to note in the last two chapters are a survey of the casualties suffered in the European theater—"the greatest American bloodletting since Grant's 1864 drive on Richmond"; a table of comparative statistics of the 61 Army divisions—45 infantry, 16 armored—that served in Europe; and a discussion of the writings of S.L.A. Marshall (generally favorable), Russell Weigley, and Martin van Creveld.

A reader with limited time would do well to concentrate on the book's last two chapters instead of just skipping through the entire book. Other readers, and particularly professional soldiers, should read this book, study its contents well (particularly the sections on combat leadership), and make it a part of their personal libraries.

***A Dose of Frontier Soldiering: The Memoirs of Corporal E.A. Bode, Frontier Regular Infantry, 1877-1882.* Edited by Thomas T. Smith. University of Nebraska Press, 1994. 237 Pages. \$29.95. Reviewed by Colonel Cole C. Kingseed, United States Army.**

"A dose of frontier soldiering" is the way Corporal Emil A. Bode described his experiences in the post-Civil War Army stationed on the Western frontier. Unlike most memoirs written from the perspective of senior ranking officers, this latest edition of frontier historiography examines the military life of the constabulary Army from the

view of an ordinary infantry soldier. Ably edited by Thomas T. Smith, one of this country's most talented soldier-scholars, Bode's memoirs are unique in that they serve as a microcosm of late 19th century military life as the frontier Army transformed itself into a more professional army dedicated to preparing for war.

Spending his entire career in the 16th Infantry Regiment, Bode, an emigrant from Hanover, saw service at Fort Sill and on the Texas frontier, and he participated in the campaign to capture the Apache chief Victorio in the New Mexico Territory in 1880. Though he never fired a shot in anger, Bode epitomized the soldiers who tamed the West. Fully half the enlisted ranks were composed of immigrants; many were uneducated; and most were attracted to the military because of "peculiar (economic) circumstances." Unlike most of his contemporaries, however, Bode was better educated and never deserted, serving his entire enlistment in an honorable fashion.

Readers enamored of the glorious cavalry charges featured in John Ford's western movies will not recognize Bode's infantryman, to say nothing of John Wayne's officers or Ward Bond's NCOs. Bode spent most of his time on such mundane pursuits as guard duty, repair of telegraph lines, and kitchen police. Bode's frank characterizations of officers and NCOs alone make this book indispensable; newly commissioned second lieutenants, for example, were not too bad "after they lost their West Point ideas." Even more interesting is Bode's description of Indian life. Like many of his contemporaries, he empathized with the plight of the Native Americans, castigating the U.S. Government for its attempts to "civilize" the Indian.

Despite the many hardships of the Old Army, however, service with the infantry in the late 1870s seemed to suit Bode. Where else could a man enjoy "the pure virgin of nature's creation daily before him, with no smiling and deceiving society to contend? If a soldier experienced hard times for a while there were surely ninety percent

sunny days coming. And if he should die, no matter what place or time, he was buried with military honors and there were no hands to disturb his sacred grave." All in all, Bode was "perfectly satisfied where he was."

From Churchill's Secret Circle to the BBC: The Biography of Lieutenant General Sir Ian Jacob. By General Sir Charles Richardson. Brassey's (UK), 1991. 304 Pages. \$50.00. Reviewed by Lieutenant Colonel Harold E. Raugh, Jr., U.S. Army.

A true and dedicated servant of the British Crown, Lieutenant General Sir Ian Jacob has made distinguished contributions in many important military and civilian endeavors. But his innate modesty and contempt for ostentation and publicity have generally prevented his achievements from being known to the public at large.

This oversight has been at least partially corrected with the publication of this book. Jacob was born in 1899, the last of 26 male members of his family who served in the East India Company's army from 1817 to 1926, or, later, in the Indian Army (including his father, who received his field marshal's baton in 1926). He was commissioned into the Royal Engineers in 1918 and served in increasingly responsible positions during the interwar years. Jacob's remarkable intellect, memory, analytical skill, and organizational abilities were fully recognized in 1938 when he was selected to be Military Assistant Secretary of the Committee of Imperial Defence.

It was at this point that Jacob was thrust into the central machinery for the administration of the entire British Empire. His position became more important after the outbreak of World War II in September 1939. Winston Churchill's selection as Prime Minister on 10 May 1940 marks the most significant and enlightening sections of this book. After a period of hesitation about Churchill's organizational abilities, Jacob became an unfailingly loyal member of Churchill's "Inner" or "Secret Circle"

From his unparalleled vantage point, Jacob worked with Churchill daily until the end of the war in 1945, and served as the Prime Minister's advance man and headed military staff support at most of the international conferences of the war. Jacob was an avid diarist, and his candid and perceptive observations of personalities and activities, short excerpts of which have appeared in many other books, make a significant contribution to the history of World War II. One item worth noting, however, is on page 127, where Jacob's diary entry for 20 August 1942 includes a quote from a book published in 1971. This may tempt readers to question whether Jacob's diary was written on that date or retrospectively.

At the end of the war Jacob, who had risen from major to major general but had not served with troops, retired from the Army to become Controller of European Services of the British Broadcasting Corporation (BBC). He became Governor General in 1952—at a crucial period when the BBC was experiencing competition from commercial television—and retired in 1960. Jacob's tenure at the BBC was highly successful. According to the author, Jacob was instrumental in ensuring "the full exploitation of the medium, the search for new capabilities, the insistence on quality in all forms of program, and the setting of a high standard throughout" (page 257). Jacob continues to contribute to civic and business activities.

The author, a retired full general who was also a Royal Engineer, empathizes with his subject, although an anti-Auchinleck, pro-Montgomery bias creeps subtly into the narrative. More than three dozen photographs ably supplement the text, along with the seven-page "chronology" of Jacob's life, chapter notes, and a bibliography.

As written by Lord Hankey, Jacob was "a true son of (his) father, and that is very high praise." This superb biography is also worthy of its subject; it is interesting, well written, and definitely well worth owning.

Abandoned by Lincoln: A Military Biography of General John Pope. By

Wallace J. Schutz and Walter N. Trenerry. University of Illinois Press, 1990. 243 Pages. \$32.50. Reviewed by Major Don Rightmyer, U.S. Air Force, Retired.

The authors of this book claim Union General John Pope as the only commanding general of a major Union army who has not had a biography written about him. Although this is not true, it is a small inaccuracy in an otherwise good Civil War history.

John Pope, a graduate in the 1842 class at West Point, spent most of his pre-Civil War Army career on the frontiers of the Army's enterprises. Commissioned as a topographical engineer, Pope participated in numerous explorations of the West as well as the active combat experiences of the Mexican War. Interestingly, the young officer had a bad habit of writing rather outspoken letters to high level civilian and military leaders outside his normal chain of command, which earned him unwanted attention on more than one occasion.

The Civil War saw Pope's first noteworthy success at the battle of Island No. 10 in the Mississippi River. Highlighted as an apparently successful general in an otherwise lackluster line of Northern military leaders, Pope was brought east to take up the fight in that theater. This Pope biography provides insights into the amazing role the political and strong personal affiliations of Northern military leaders played in the Civil War. For example, when many of General George McClellan's Army of the Potomac troops were taken from him on the Virginia Peninsula and sent to Pope's Army of Virginia, some of the subordinate leaders essentially refused to fight for Pope.

This book covers the eastern battles of Cedar Mountain, Groveton, and Second Manassas in which Pope led Union troops. After his failure in the East, Pope was sent back into the western theater where he spent the rest of the war and the rest of his 44-year Army career.

The book is supplemented by two appendixes—one on Fitz-John Porter's

courts-martial for his refusal to fight under Pope at Second Manassas and the other on Pope's generalship.

Abandoned by Lincoln is a very worthwhile, compact biography on one of the succession of generals who fought in the Virginia theater of operations before Lincoln finally identified Grant as the man for the job. Pope's life story offers an interesting perspective into the Civil War as well as nearly half a century of the Army's history on America's frontiers.

Gettysburg: Culp's Hill and Cemetery Hill. By Harry W. Pfanz. University of North Carolina Press, 1994. 507 Pages. \$37.50. *The Second Day at Gettysburg: Essays on Confederate and Union Leadership.* Edited by Gary W. Gallagher. Kent State University Press, 1993. 210 Pages. \$24.00. *Gettysburg: A Meditation on War and Values.* By Kent Gramm. Indiana University Press, 1994. 288 Pages. \$24.95. Reviewed by Doctor Charles E. White, Infantry School Historian.

Interest in the Battle of Gettysburg (1-3 July 1863) has captivated Americans for more than 130 years. The recent film, "Gettysburg," is a stirring testimonial to the enduring fascination Americans have with our nation's greatest struggle. This review highlights the works of Harry Pfanz, Gary Gallagher, and Kent Gramm, who have added three more books to the voluminous literature that already exists on Gettysburg.

As its title suggests, *Gettysburg: Culp's Hill and Cemetery Hill* is the story of the fight on the Federal right on 2 July. It is essentially a continuation of Pfanz's earlier study, *Gettysburg, The Second Day* (University of North Carolina Press, 1987), which dealt exclusively with actions on the Federal left on 2 July. Both works should be read together. Both are superb tactical narratives that focus primarily on combat at the regimental level.

For anyone seeking every tactical detail of the second day at Gettysburg, Pfanz is the author to read. Unfortunately, he gets so involved in

recreating an almost minute-by-minute account of the fighting that he loses sight of the larger picture. The student in search of a comprehensive study of this crucial campaign and battle should read Edwin B. Coddington, *The Gettysburg Campaign: A Study in Command* (Macmillan, 1968).

The Second Day at Gettysburg, a superb collection of essays, is a continuation of an earlier study, *The First Day at Gettysburg*. As with the previous work, Gary Gallagher has asked five noted historians to analyze Union and Confederate leadership on 2 July. Their essays encompass the famous struggles for Little Round Top, the Wheatfield, and the Peach Orchard, as well as the lesser known fighting along the slopes of Culp's Hill.

When writing their papers, the contributors examined a number of intriguing questions: Did Lee have better options, or did he give free rein to his naturally aggressive personality? Were Longstreet's actions at Gettysburg consistent with his behavior throughout the war? What really happened to the Union Twelfth Corps on 2 July 1863? Why should modern students exercise great care when criticizing Civil War commanders for failures on the battlefield? These are only a few of the topics addressed in this fine study of Union and Confederate leadership at Gettysburg.

Lastly, in *Gettysburg: A Meditation on War and Values*, Kent Gramm offers a unique look at the battle. Following Henry David Thoreau's dictum that "it is the province of the historian to find out, not what was, but what is," Gramm actually writes the story of two battlefields: Gettysburg during July 1863 and Gettysburg during the 1990s. In doing so, he asks a number of provocative questions: What motivated Americans to die in great numbers for principles as abstract as "union" and "states rights"? What have we done with the heritage they bequeathed to us? Do the battles we fight today have as noble a purpose as that fought at Gettysburg in 1863? Do Americans today really understand what it cost to preserve the Union?

This splendid book is a must for

anyone who has visited Civil War battlefields and wondered who those people were and how we relate to them today.

RECENT AND RECOMMENDED

See, I Told You So. By Rush Limbaugh. Pocket Books, 1993. 320 Pages. \$24.00, Hardcover.

Enlisted Soldier's Guide. Third Edition. Stackpole Books, 1993. 240 Pages. \$12.95, Softbound.

Army Officer's Guide. 46th Edition. Stackpole Books, 1993. 608 Pages. \$19.95, Softbound.

Arms and the Woman: Female Soldiers at War. By Kate Muir. Sinclair-Stevenson, 1994 (distributed by Trafalgar Square, North Pomfret, VT 05053). 209 Pages. \$24.95.

The Naval Institute Guide to World Naval Weapons Systems, 1994 Update. By Norman Friedman. Naval Institute Press, 1994. 159 Pages. \$40.00.

Codebreakers: The Inside Story of Bletchley Park. By F.H. Hinsley and Alan Stripp. Oxford University Press, 1993. 280 Pages. \$25.00.

19 Stars: A Study in Military Character and Leadership. By Edgar F. Puryear, Jr. Originally published in 1971. Presidio Press, 1993. 468 Pages. \$14.95, Softbound.

Sun-Tzu's Art of War. Translated by Ralph D. Sawyer. Westview Press, 1994. 375 Pages. \$9.95, Softbound.

Contemporary Issues in Leadership. Third Edition. Edited by William E. Rosenbach and Robert L. Taylor. Westview Press, 1993. 233 Pages. \$49.95, Hardcover; \$17.95, Softbound.

Armed With Cameras: The American Military Photographers of World War II. By Peter Maslowski. The Free Press, 1993. 412 Pages. \$29.95.

Veterans Benefits: The Complete Guide. By Keith D. Snyder and Richard E. O'Dell, with Craig Kubey. HarperReference, 1994. 410 Pages. \$15.00.

The Commandos: The Inside Story of America's Secret Soldiers. By Douglas C. Waller. Simon & Schuster, 1994. 399 Pages. \$23.00.

The Pentagon Paradox: The Development of the F-18 Hornet. By James P. Stevenson. Naval Institute Press, 1993. 448 Pages. \$24.95.

100 Miles from Baghdad: With the French in Desert Storm. By James J. Cooke. Praeger Publishers, 1993. 256 Pages. \$45.00.

From Sea to Shining Sea: From the War of 1812 to the Mexican War, the Saga of America's Expansion. By Robert Leckie. HarperCollins, 1993. 650 Pages. \$30.00.

The Legend of the Mutilated Victory: Italy, the Great War, and the Paris Peace Conference, 1915-1919. By H. James Burgwyn. Contributions to the Study of World History, Number 38. Greenwood Press, 1993. 368 Pages. \$55.00.

In the Aftermath of War: U.S. Support for Reconstruction and Nation-Building in Panama Following Just Cause. By Richard H. Shultz, Jr. Air University Press, 1993. 73 Pages.

Uncertain Warriors: Lyndon Johnson and His Vietnam Advisers. By David M. Barrett. University of Kansas Press, 1993. 296 Pages. \$35.00.

Silent Warfare: Understanding the World of Intelligence. Second Edition, Revised. By Abram N. Shulsky and Gary J. Schmitt. Brassey's (US), 1993. 288 Pages. \$19.95, Hardcover.